

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

IN RE:

TERRORIST ATTACKS ON
SEPTEMBER 11, 2001

)
) Civil Action No. 03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)
)

) **[PROPOSED] ORDER**
)
)

SARAH NETBURN, United States Magistrate Judge:

Defendant Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (“Saudi Arabia”) has submitted a request to maintain under seal and/or redact certain documents submitted to the Court as exhibits in connection with the motion to compel filed by the Plaintiffs’ Executive Committees (“Plaintiffs”) on November 30, 2018 (the “Motion to Compel”), and Plaintiffs’ December 28, 2018 opposition to Saudi Arabia’s letter-motion to modify the scope of supplemental discovery (the “Scope Opposition”). Plaintiffs opposed Saudi Arabia’s request. Having considered the arguments of the parties, the Court GRANTS Saudi Arabia’s request as follows:

1. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia’s letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, the following exhibits submitted by Plaintiffs in support of the Motion to Compel shall be filed under seal in their entirety:

Plaintiffs' Exh. No.	Bates No.
10	KSA0000006679
15	KSA0000001253 KSA0000001256
16	KSA0000000564-65
18	KSA0000001618
22	KSA0000001277
24	KSA0000001268-70
25	KSA0000000605-07 KSA0000000612 KSA0000001193-94
26	KSA0000001250-51 KSA0000001258 KSA0000001623
30	KSA0000001555-56
33	KSA0000001234-35
34	KSA0000001236
35	KSA0000006667-68

Plaintiffs' Exh. No.	Bates No.
36	KSA0000001534-35 KSA0000001720
40	KSA0000000556-61
41	KSA0000006868
53	KSA0000001822-24, KSA0000001826 KSA0000001829-33 KSA0000001835 KSA0000001837
28	KSA0000006643
63	KSA0000000553-54
65	KSA0000005769-78
68	KSA0000001274-75
73	KSA0000006882-902
74	KSA0000001249
77	KSA0000000583
84	KSA0000006860-63
85	KSA0000001291

2. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia's letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, the following exhibits submitted by Plaintiffs in support of the Motion to Compel shall be filed with the redactions proposed by Saudi Arabia:

Plaintiffs' Exh. No.	Bates No.
7-C	N/A
7-D	N/A
7-E	N/A
7-F	N/A
7-G	N/A
7-H	N/A
7-I	N/A
7-J	N/A

Plaintiffs' Exh. No.	Bates No.
34	KSA0000001237
39	KSA0000004623
59	N/A
60	KSA0000006645 KSA0000001180-88
61	KSA0000006461
83	N/A

3. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia's letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, the following exhibits submitted by Saudi Arabia in opposition to the Motion to Compel shall be filed under seal in their entirety:

Defendant's Exh. No.	Bates No.
2	KSA0000006667-68
3	KSA0000000589
4	KSA0000006673
5	KSA0000000566
6	KSA0000006810
7	KSA0000006861
8	KSA0000001349
9	KSA0000001375-93
10	KSA0000001213-14
11	KSA0000001223
12	KSA0000001230-31
13	KSA0000001227
14	KSA0000001557
15	KSA0000002689-97
19	KSA0000002802

Defendant's Exh. No.	Bates No.
20	KSA0000002783
24	KSA0000001620
25	KSA0000001624
27	KSA0000001274-75
28	KSA0000001226
31	KSA0000001179
47	KSA0000006796-99
49	KSA0000000908
50	KSA0000006660
60	KSA0000006647
61	KSA0000006661
62	KSA0000006643
63	KSA0000001833
16	KSA0000001207
17	KSA0000000591
64	KSA0000006644

4. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia's letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, the following exhibits submitted by Saudi Arabia in opposition to the Motion to Compel shall be filed with the redactions proposed by Saudi Arabia:

Defendant's Exh. No.	Bates No.
23	KSA0000006882-902
32	KSA0000002332
42	KSA0000000943
43	KSA0000000961 KSA0000000962

Defendant's Exh. No.	Bates No.
64	KSA0000006645
65	KSA0000001180-88
66	KSA0000006464

5. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia's letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, the following exhibits submitted by Plaintiffs in support of the Scope Opposition shall be filed under seal in their entirety: Plaintiffs' Exhibit 4 (KSA0000002691-94) and Plaintiffs' Exhibit 5 (KSA0000002695-97).

6. For the reasons stated in Saudi Arabia's letter-motion and in the Exhibit A attached thereto, Plaintiffs' Exhibit 6 (KSA0000002404) submitted in support of the Scope Opposition shall be filed with the redactions proposed by Saudi Arabia.

7. Within seven (7) days of this order, the parties shall file on the public docket redacted versions of the briefs submitted (a) in support or opposition to the Motion to Compel and (b) in support or opposition to Saudi Arabia's letter-motion to modify the scope of supplemental discovery, in the form proposed by Saudi Arabia on January 15, 2019. At that time, the parties shall each file the exhibits attached to their respective briefs in accordance with this order. For each exhibit maintained under seal pursuant to this order, the filing party shall docket a one-page slip sheet indicating the exhibit number and the fact that it has been filed under seal. Saudi Arabia need not re-file its letter-brief in support of its letter-motion to modify the scope of supplemental discovery, which has already been filed on the public docket without redactions.

8. Notwithstanding paragraph 7, within seven (7) days of the FBI approving redactions to Plaintiffs' reply in further support of the Motion to Compel, the parties shall jointly submit via email to the Court proposed redactions to that brief.

9. Saudi Arabia may file on the public docket its letter-motion regarding confidentiality and a redacted version of Exhibit A attached thereto, in the form proposed by Saudi Arabia on January 15, 2019.

SO ORDERED.

DATED:

New York, New York

SARAH NETBURN
United States Magistrate Judge